Restlessness, Resoluteness, and Reason
the evolving passage of culturally responsive pedagogies

Angus H Macfarlane
Professor of Māori Research
University of Canterbury
Annual Graham Nuthall Lecture 2019
Aims of this presentation

- Take a glimpse at history, and at recent thinkers’ contentions
- Consider the research platforms of recent thinkers
- Look at notions of teacher effectiveness
- Espouse further notions – when culture is part of the mix
- Contend that culturally responsive teachers play a leading role in a transformation that transfers knowledge into real acts of knowing
- Provide examples of accessible, existing, culturally-responsive programs, frameworks and strategies .......
- Conclude with a cluster of Education Imaginaries
Acknowledgements

- Nuthall family
- Previous annual Nuthall lecture presenters
- UC Te Whare Wānanga o Waitaha
- Te Rangai Ako me te Hauora
- Te Rū Rangahau
- Mana whenua
- Mātā waka
- Te Arawa waka
- People I have worked alongside in 40+ years of education
Connecting to and extending on Graham Nuthall’s work...

- Graham Nuthall, NZARE keynote 2001, and other works
- Tamariki construct their own microworld, individually and socially
- Prior knowledge differs remarkably from one learner to another
- There are ethnically linked ways of thinking, feeling, and acting that are acquired through socialisation (Phinney & Rotheram, 1987)
Making connections to Adrienne Alton-Lee, Guy Claxton, and Alberto Rodrigues

- Adrienne Alton-Lee
- Guy Claxton
- Alberto Rodriguez
- John Hattie
- **Thin Learning Power**: attention to authority, reliance on authority, limited manipulation, recapitulation
- **Rich Learning Power**: perseverance, flexibility, imagination, empathy, taking feedback, questioning sources
- ....... **Culturally Imbued Learning Power**: whanaungatanga, manaakitanga, kotahitanga, rangatiratanga, pūmanawatanga
- Graham, Adrienne, Guy, John, Alberto, other annual Nuthall presenters, lead us to ask big questions ....
Ngā pātai nui. The big questions

• What do we really want for our tamariki?
• How can we best prepare them for an uncertain world?

........... Both questions, Claxton contends, are intellectually relevant, and morally urgent

........... Both questions, Durie contends, are intellectually relevant, morally urgent, and contextually bound

....But first, a glimpse at the past
Huataki
Te ao tāwhito
Having to cope with social and economic change

- Almost complete loss of the ownership and control of land resources
- The development of alien systems of national administration
- Decimation by warfare and disease
- Enforced migration into cities
- Imposition of alien religious systems
- A money economy
- Changes in styles of housing, clothing, gender roles, status systems, and language
- The pressures on ethnic identity
- *A culturally deprived education system*
.... events that have had varying degrees of influence

- Native Schools Act 1867. The James Belich descriptor....
- Effective teaching of English emphasised as primary task
- Corporal punishment during 19th and very much of 20th century
- Hunn Report
- Johnson Report
- Māori Boarding Schools
- Te Kōhanga Reo
- Kura Kaupapa Māori and Wharekura
- Ten Point Plan for Māori Education
- Closing the Gaps
- Te Whāriki
- Eke Pānuku
- Te Kauhua
- Ka Hikitia

What are the main dangers of Eurocentric hegemony in the sector?

1. The lack of attention to alternatives to mainstream knowledge (which is not only Eurocentric but typically focused on middle-class beliefs and practices) has the potential to leave the sector impoverished.

2. There is the potential for damage because of the 'colonisation' of local knowledge and theory and practice by Eurocentric thought. The dominance of Eurocentric ways of research and teaching helps legitimise world-wide inequality.

Interest in culturally relevant pedagogies grew out of a restlessness about the lack of attention to cultural ways of knowing and learning. Links to the thinking of Paulo Freire.

The movement has its greatest inspiration in the figure of critics and writers and thinkers such as Gloria Ladson-Billings, Geneva Gay, Pauline Lipman, Cecelia Peirce, Tyrone Howard; Angela Valenzuela, Lisa Delpit, Paris, McCarty and Lee, Oscar Kawagley, Bryan Brayboy, Ray Barnhardt, Tom Cavanagh and others.

In Aotearoa New Zealand we have education (discipline) leaders too, who model resoluteness in education: Rose Pere, Iritana Tawhiwhirangi, Mason Durie, Tilly and Tamati Reedy, Tuhiwai and Hingangaroa Smith, Wally Penetito, Sonja Macfarlane, Catherine Savage, Gail Gillon, Cath Rau, Jill Bevan-Brown, Lesley Rameka, Russell Bishop, Mere Berryman, Ted Glynn, and many more.

It is their faith in culturally grounded rationality in a quest for better ways, and their courage to confront conventionalists that has made an impact. Their critical thinking emphasises the development of rationality and skills of evaluation of arguments, identification of assumptions and formulation of lines of reason.

Te ao hurihuri: More recent thinkers .....  

- **Teacher deficit theorising** impacting the quality of teacher/student relationships with Māori students (Bishop, et al., 2009; Clarke et al., 2017)
- **Pathologizing classroom practices** such as transmission teaching, remedial programs and behavior modification programs (Bishop, et al., 2009)
- **Denial of cultural difference** resulting in the use of the same identification procedures and assessment measures for all children regardless of their culture and language (Bevan-Brown & Bevan-Brown, 1999; Cullen & Bevan-Brown, 1999; Glynn, 2009)
- **Low teacher expectation** leading to self-fulfilling prophecies (Bevan-Brown, 2000; Bishop et al., 2009; Turner, 2014; Turner & Rubie)
- **Negative and stereotypical attitudes** toward Māori children, their parents and whānau (families), e.g. teachers disbelieving or ignoring parental concerns (Bevan-Brown, 2002)
- **Abdication of responsibility for cultural input into education**, e.g. Teachers not addressing cultural issues in the belief that this is the sole responsibility of kura kaupapa (total immersion schooling) Māori or Māori teachers in English-medium schools (Bourke et al., 2001)
- **Economic rationalization** and commercially-driven values which result in Māori relevant services not being provided because they are not economically viable (Bevan-Brown, 2002)
- **Teachers as champions** (Fickel et al. 2018; Macfarlane, 2004; Macfarlane, 2007; Macfarlane, Macfarlane & Webber, 2015; Savage, Macfarlane, Macfarlane, Fickel & Te Hemi. 2013)
Data Stories

Raises Questions
Teachers state what 'ako' means to them as an educator.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Percentage</th>
<th>Little</th>
<th>Some</th>
<th>Clear</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ako'</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Teachers understand what can make a difference to raising achievement for Maori students.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>High</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Series1</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Teachers have an understanding of the cultural ways of thinking, acting and believing of the following groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Low</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>High</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Maori</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pasifika</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Teachers aware of the latest research in realising Maori Potential to inform teaching practice.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Ka Hikitia</th>
<th>Pasifika</th>
<th>BES-Diversity</th>
<th>Te Mana</th>
<th>Culture Counts</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Uses resource to inform teaching practice</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Become Familiar</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Little</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unfamiliar</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
More questions than answers?

- Why is it that what we have done in education has not changed the status quo, and instead has (possibly) perpetuated it?
- Why is it that the status quo in New Zealand is one where educational disparities are ethnically based, and have been so for some considerable time?
- How can we provide ITE programs and teachers’ professional development programmes in such a way that it galvanises their empathy, skill and confidence in their work with tamariki and whānau?
  (adapted from Berryman, 2007)

More questions lead to anxiety about ..... more to do
- So many adjustments, so little time
- The peril of exhaustion
- The Self and The Group
- The notion of ‘fit’
- Joyce and Showers ....
  “....I’m a maths teacher. I’m a good maths teacher. Now I’ve got this ........ stuff to deal with”
The wero is ‘the how’...
The whakapapa of culturally responsive pedagogy

Strengths based pedagogies

• Culturally Relevant (Ladson Billings, 1995)
• Culturally Responsive (Gay, 2002)
• Reality Pedagogy (Emdin)
• Culturally Revitalizing (McCarty & Lee, 2014)

Culturally Responsive (Gay, 2002)

• Developing a cultural diversity knowledge base (p. 106)
• Designing culturally relevant curricula (p. 108)
• “Cultural caring”, and “building learning community” (p. 109)
• Cross cultural communications” (p. 110)
• Cultural congruity in classroom instruction (p. 112)

There is no prescription for ‘doing’ culturally responsive pedagogy (CRP)

• CRP is part of the science and art of teaching not an add-on separate from the methodology, methods, people and context. It is preferred that CRP is not looked at in isolation.
• CRP is a Māori and non-Māori responsibility.
• While there is no prescription for CRP; there are many possible ways of addressing an approach....
Suggested Solutions Contentions

- Caring for person (socio-culturally located) (soft care)
- Caring for performance of student (socio-cognitively located) (hard care)
- Identifying and transforming the potential of Māori students
- Creating a secure, well-managed learning environment
- Insisting on effective teaching interaction – valuing Māori students
- Connecting to culture – engagement with Te Ao Māori
- Managing transitions (David Riley, 2007)
- Astute use of information (see Report from Office of the AG)
- Linking the culture of home and school
- Procuring a repertoire of strategies
Some research studies on culturally responsive teachers

Understand that CRP includes:

• Insisting on high academic and behaviour standards and working to help students achieve them
• Tapping into students’ experiences and culture
• Considering nuances of dominant discourse
• Taking at-risk students under their wing
• Perceiving teaching as a calling
• Linking learning to real world

Understand that CRP sometimes requires:

• non-negotiable boundaries
• moderate language
• moderate emotions
• clear explanations
• tough responses
• understated kindness
• hard care .... warm demanders
Frameworks and Models
A selection that covers a generation

- Educultural Wheel *
- Te Pikinga ki Runga
- Hikairo Schema *
- Braided Rivers: He Awa Whiria
- Reading Development *
- Ka Awatea
- Huakina Mai

.........it is to three* of these that we now turn
A co-existence of Māori concepts that vary together in patterned ways (adapted from Rogoff, 2003)

- Whanaungatanga
- Rangatiratanga
- Kotahitanga
- Manaakitanga
- Pūmanawatanga
The Educultural Wheel

WHANAUNGATANA
Building Relationships
- Organise hui whakatauki
- Know your students’ backgrounds
- People in the community are excellent resources
- Involve parents and whanau
- Use cooperative learning structures
- Teacher shares own experiences

KOTAHITANGA
Ethic of Bonding
- Bond of beginning of year
- Whole class rewards
- Classroom treaty
- Person to person bonding
- Mihi in the morning ritual
- Homework ritual
- Teach whole school, together
- Hui whakatika
- Visibility of principal

Nau te rourou
Naku te rourou
Ka ora ai e iwi

Korea ka p朝

A choppy sea
can be navigated
(Perseverance)

PŪMANAWATANGA
Morale, Tone, Pulse
He moana pukepuke
E kenga e te waka

Mana tu mana ora
Mana noho mana mate

MANAAKITANGA
Ethic of Caring
- Safe haven classroom
- Care of obligatory
- Head as well as heart
- Greeting and seating
- Content and manner
- Attend to student
- Who’s who? What’s what
- Opening, closing, dismissing

Although small (child)
you are precious like a
greenstone
(Affection)

RANGATIRATANGA
Teacher Effectiveness
- Ihi: assertiveness
- Teacher’s demeanour
- Body language
- Passion and enthusiasm
- Withness or mana
- Provide real life experiences
- Student friendly vernacular
- Be firm, be brief, be gone
- Kia ihi, kia poto, me kaere

Empathy motivates
Apathy demotivates
(Encouragement)

The Hikairo Schema

Whakaakoranga Kōhungahunga
THE HIKAIRO SCHEMA

Culturally responsive teaching and learning in early childhood education settings

Angus Macfarlane, Sonja Macfarlane, Sharlene Tierney, J.R. Kuntz, Benita Rarere-Briggs, Marika Currie, Marie Gibson, and Roimata Macfarlane

Huataki
Beginnings

Ihi
Demonstrating assertiveness

Oranga
"The pulse"
Balance of power
Relevance
Scaffolding

Kotahitanga
Establishing inclusion

Āwhinatia
Building connections

Ira Manaaki
Ethos of care

Rangatiratanga
Enhancing meaning
Embodiment of Two Streams of Knowledge
unleashing the potential of ākonga

“Ka Hikitia: Accelerating Success “

“culturally relevant”
pedagogy
(Clarke et al., 2017; Ladson-Billings, 1995)

“transformative education
for culturally diverse
learners” (Hale, Snow-Geron & Morales 2008; Smith, 2005).

“sociocultural, nested
levels of interaction”
(Macfarlane, Macfarlane & Gillon, 2015; Rogoff, 1995)

‘the heart, the head and the
hand’ (Sergiovanni, 1991)

‘Choice Theory for Lead
Teachers’ (Glasser, 2005)

‘Promoting optimum
motivation’ (Ames, 1992;
Cavanagh et al., 2008)

‘Aptitude, instruction,
environment’
(Ysseldyke & Christensen, 1998)

Distinctiveness: A braided approach is innovative; has an element of the pioneering spirit
Coherency: A braided approach draws from selected, evidence-based practice
Impact: A braided approach is potentially more powerful than either on its own
Figure 1: A Braided Rivers Approach to the integration of knowledge to facilitate children’s early reading success. (Gillon & Macfarlane, 2017, p.166)

Table 1 Examples of activities to facilitate early reading success within a ‘Braided Rivers Approach’ integrating influences on reading with indicators of academic success for indigenous population. (Gillon & Macfarlane, 2017, p.166)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Influences on Reading Development</th>
<th>Ecological influences</th>
<th>Cognitive influences</th>
<th>Psychological influences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Strong cultural identity</strong></td>
<td>Encourage family or caregivers to share culturally relevant stories (both oral and written stories) with their child. Learn about the cultural values, myths, or legends cultural stories reflect</td>
<td>Develop skills for early reading such as phonological awareness and letter knowledge, utilizing stories, vocabulary, and teaching materials</td>
<td>Use successful older peers, community leaders, idols from the same cultural background as the child as role models; expect the child to succeed in literacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Resilient, healthy well-being</strong></td>
<td>Liaise with community leaders, and health professionals to ensure a holistic approach to managing health issues to allow the child to engage in literacy learning (e.g. hearing, vision, nutritional checks)</td>
<td>Create a positive learning environment, provide quality feedback on learning attempts, and scaffold tasks to create successful learning experiences</td>
<td>Help the child understand the importance and value of strong spoken and written communication skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A strong sense of place and bicultural or multicultural identities</strong></td>
<td>Understand the child’s cultural customs and practices and acknowledge these when liaising with family, community and in working with the child</td>
<td>Integrate vocabulary from the child’s native language into speech and language teaching activities. Use simple greetings in the child’s native language</td>
<td>Demonstrate genuine interest in the child’s cultural heritage; encourage the child’s ability to speak different languages and to talk about cultural experiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Family are engaged in child’s learning</strong></td>
<td>Take time to become involved in the community to build positive, trusting relationships; respect and value cultural differences. Listen and value the family’s perceptions about the child’s speech–language development</td>
<td>Engage family members or caregivers in therapy sessions, intervention activities, and planning learning goals; share assessment findings in culturally sensitive and relevant ways</td>
<td>Share successful learning outcomes; develop the family’s pride in their child’s spoken and written language achievements; Take an interest in the child’s/ family’s participation in cultural events (e.g. cultural festivals)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Indicators of academic success for Indigenous learners: Ecological influences** (Gillon & Macfarlane, 2017, p.166)

**Strong cultural identity**
- Encourage family or caregivers to share culturally relevant stories (both oral and written stories) with their child. Learn about the cultural values, myths, or legends cultural stories reflect.

**Resilient, healthy wellbeing**
- Liaise with community leaders, and health professionals to ensure a holistic approach to managing health issues to allow the child to engage in literacy learning (e.g. hearing, vision, nutritional checks).

**A strong sense of place and bicultural or multicultural identities**
- Understand the child’s cultural customs and practices and acknowledge these when liaising with family, community and in working with the child.

**Family are engaged in child’s learning**
- Take time to become involved in the community to build positive, trusting relationships; respect and value cultural differences. Listen and value the family’s perceptions about the child’s speech—language development.
And so many more…

Ka Awatea: A model of Māori success

Mana Motuhake – a positive sense of identity
Mana Tū – a sense of courage and resilience
Mana Ūkaipo – a sense of place
Mana Tangatarua – a sense of two worlds
It is time to ....

....“Listen to culture”

• “Commitment to a culturally-responsive teaching approach for Māori learners and whanau presupposes a willingness to understand and experience something of Te Ao Māori.” (Macfarlane, 2003)

• ASKED (Campinha-Bacote, 2010)
Kia whakatōmuri te haere whakamua

I walk backwards into the future – my ancestors are ever present

https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/full/10.1177/1463949116677923
Looking Back at 50 Years of Māori Education (NZJES, 2015)

Article written for the 50th Jubilee of the Journal. After summoning courage, the five contributions selected were, in chronological order:

- **Ako (1982)** – Pere - The concept fundamentally proposes that the learner and teacher are simultaneously juxtaposed, so that the learner is at the same time the teacher, and vice-versa. Transmission of knowledge and understanding is ignited within interactions (p.187)

- **Te Whare Tapa Whā (1984, 1994)** – Durie - The model is founded on a holistic approach to lived contexts for Indigenous peoples, and especially for Māori. In its essence, the model typifies the four walls of a symbolising interconnecting and interdependent dimensions for Māori wellbeing: taha wairua (spiritual); taha hinengaro (mental and emotional); taha tinana (physical); and taha whānau (relational and social) (pp.187-88)

- **Te Whāriki (1996a)** – T & T Reedy - entirety, Te Whāriki provides a holistic and supportive context for all pre-school children to learn within a bilingual and bicultural educational setting. Te Whāriki is ‘the mat’ woven with principles, strands and goals that have their genesis in te ao Māori (p.188)

- **Decolonizing Methodologies (1999)** – Smith - Smith’s work assertively refers to centring Indigenous concepts and worldviews and coming to know research and theory through Indigenous lenses, for Indigenous purposes. It is counter-hegemonic, informative and challenging (p.188)

- **Te Kotahitanga (2001)** – MoE - has provided teachers with professional development opportunities to support the implementation of culturally responsive strategies based on caring relationships with rangatahi in secondary schools. Student voice has been a significant factor in the emergent thinking, theorising and, eventually, application of Te Kotahitanga’s structured processes
• Challenge the status-quo
• Critique the knowledge we take for granted
• Acknowledge epistemologies of local research, global considerations, and mātauranga Māori
• Look for different angles
• Look for how our children, your children, their children, can grow up in the best possible way
• E te rangatira Graham, hei aha rā, tū tonu te mana o ōu mahi
“...only when teachers understand the principles by which their actions shape the learning process will they be able to ensure effective learning’ (p. 301)


“... when teachers understand and draw from values from Te Ao Māori, they not only draw from these values, something happens when they see relevance..... And these teachers appear to have more success at drawing Māori learners into the context”

EDEM685 Culturally Inclusive Pedagogies: Motivating Diverse Learners. UC postgraduate class, May 2019.
With your food basket, Graham Nuthall, and our food baskets, Learners everywhere be well nourished.